جامعة دار السلام الإسلامية
UNIDA GONTOR UNIVERSITY OF DARUSSALAM GONTOR

Jurnal Ettisal <ettisal@unida.gontor.ac.id>

Reviewer's Improvement Results

7 messages

bustami Bustami <bustami@uinsu.ac.id> Thu, Oct 2, 2025 at 7:14 PM
To: Jurnal Ettisal <ettisal@unida.gontor.ac.id>

Based on the review results submitted on September 30, 2025, and all input from the review, I have included it in the introduction, research methods, and relevant cultural findings. I hope this information will be considered by the reviewer and meets the reviewer's requirements.

Regards

Jurnal Komunikasi Strategis.docx
61K

Jurnal Ettisal <ettisal@unida.gontor.ac.id> Sun, Oct 26, 2025 at 11:07 AM
To: bustami Bustami <bustami@uinsu.ac.id>

Thanks, I have received it.
[Quoted text hidden]

Jurnal Ettisal <ettisal@unida.gontor.ac.id> Wed, Dec 3, 2025 at 10:58 AM
To: bustami Bustami <bustami@uinsu.ac.id>

[Fast Track] Dear author, here we attach the last Reviewer Result:

1. The abstract mentions "strategic communication management." What specific communication theory or model (e.g., Two-Way Symmetrical Model, Situational Crisis Communication Theory, or Excellence Theory) guides the evaluation of the police PR unit's effectiveness?
2. The introduction need to be expanded with at least 3-4 paragraph. The research, actually based on 'replication' of previous studies. But, we still not see a rigor investigation about 'similar' previous research and study concerning it. You can also refer to international context of reference:
    a. Wang, Congyu, Qiuyue Gao, and Hu Wang. "Evaluations of Eight Communication Skills in Police–Civilian Interactions." *Criminal Justice and Behavior* 51.11 (2024): 1755-1772.
    b. Wozniak, Kevin H., Kevin M. Drakulich, and Brian R. Calfano. "Do photos of police-civilian interactions influence public opinion about the police? A multimethod test of media effects." *Journal of experimental criminology* 17.2 (2021): 1-27.
    c. Kwon, Jihyun, and Scot Wortley. "Policing the police: Public perceptions of civilian oversight in Canada." *Race and Justice* 12.4 (2022): 644-668.
    d. Burke, Kelly C. "Why interracial police-civilian interpersonal interactions can go poorly: Police officer stereotype threat." *Psychology, Crime & Law* 29.6 (2023): 584-610.

e. Turner, Jacob R., and Maggie Shum. "How citizens meet the state: Police contact, trust, and civic engagement." *Urban Affairs Review* 61.1 (2025): 3-37.

f. Mourtgos, Scott M., et al. "Speaking of reform: Experimental insights into influencing police executives' perspectives on civilian oversight." *Criminology & Public Policy* 23.3 (2024): 689-720.

3. You highlight the shift from a military-style to a civilian-focused force. How will the research conceptually define the communication gap that exists in this transitional phase? Is the gap primarily procedural (lack of formal feedback mechanisms), cultural (inability to adapt national messages to local dialects/customs), or relational (low trust stemming from historical police actions)?
4. The Tanah Karo region is characterized by diverse ethnic groups (Indigenous Karo, various migrants). How will the research operationalize the challenge of "cultural sensitivity" in communication? Does this involve analyzing whether police communication utilizes the local Karo language/customs or if it successfully mediates communication during inter-ethnic conflicts?
5. Tyler's Procedural Justice Theory links police legitimacy to the fairness of procedures and quality of treatment. How does the research specifically argue that the quality of communication (timeliness, respect, consistency) is the direct mediator for the public's perception of procedural fairness in the Tanah Karo context?
6. The research is important because it is set in Indonesia, a developing nation. How does the study propose to differentiate the communication challenges stemming from universal police institutional hierarchy versus those challenges specific to local resource constraints and cultural heterogeneity in the North Sumatra highlands?
7. The police personnel sample includes the head of PR and officers engaged in community interaction. How does the interpretive framework specifically account for the inherent organizational bias in their narratives (e.g., officers emphasizing compliance and policy success rather than admitting failures in the two-way symmetrical model)?
8. The results indicate difficulty in obtaining information outside weekly press conferences, signaling poor responsiveness. How does this bottleneck (indicative of a weak Two-Way Asymmetric Model) undermine the overall multi-channel strategy? Does message inconsistency arise because the personalized messages of Bhabinkamtibmas contradict the centralized, formal messaging disseminated via Facebook?
9. You mention that the Polres utilizes Karo language radio and the regional publication Harian Analisa. What communication model and strategy are employed in these traditional media channels? Does traditional media primarily operate under the Public Information Model (one-way) to reach older audiences, while digital media aims for the Two-Way Symmetrical Model?
10. The Polres gathers feedback (via Komsos/WhatsApp) but lacks a systematic mechanism for evaluation (a challenge). How does this failure to systematically evaluate feedback fundamentally defeat the Two-Way Symmetrical Model and undermine the perception of Procedural Justice?
11. This section remains highly normative and narrative. It still lacks sufficient supporting evidence, such as:
a. The existence of satisfaction survey results,
b. Screenshots from social media showing public impressions of the police,
c. Statements from public figures (for example, during public events such as Independence Day or religious gatherings) that position the police as an institution experiencing increased public trust.
12. The police recommendations highlight the need for better resource and personnel distribution. How does the recurring resource constraint (a Predisposing Factor) act as the primary physical barrier preventing the Polres Tanah Karo from fully adopting the Two-Way Symmetrical Model?

[Quoted text hidden]

12718 Strategic Communication Management Reviewer.docx
71K

Jurnal Ettisal <ettisal@unida.gontor.ac.id> Wed, Dec 3, 2025 at 11:08 AM
To: bustami Bustami <bustami@uinsu.ac.id>

Use this username to log-in; and send the revision to OJS
user: fairizalrahman
password: 79k*dJkJ-

[Quoted text hidden]

---

bustami Bustami <bustami@uinsu.ac.id> Wed, Dec 3, 2025 at 1:50 PM

To: Jurnal Ettisal <ettisal@unida.gontor.ac.id>

With your permission, I am uploading the revised journal for your consideration. Thank you and best regards.
[Quoted text hidden]



Karo 2.png
46K

Jurnal Ettisal <ettisal@unida.gontor.ac.id> Sun, Dec 7, 2025 at 11:46 AM
To: bustami Bustami <bustami@uinsu.ac.id>

Dear author, we are inform you that your Draft had been Accepted.

To get the LoA, kindly fill this form: https://docs.google.com/forms/d/1mRIXpwbe3ULUNVrQ1EqD0wGQ1tnc9_nUy6GqZmNmyv0/viewform?edit_requested=true
[Quoted text hidden]

---

bustami Bustami <bustami@uinsu.ac.id> Sun, Dec 7, 2025 at 6:18 PM
To: Jurnal Ettisal <ettisal@unida.gontor.ac.id>

Izin saya sudah mengisi From pengajuan LoA jurnal Ettisal. Mohon bantuannya, terimakasih.
salam hormat

[Quoted text hidden]



Etisal.png
37K